

6]bUbW. 'K]YXYf\YfghY`i b['XYg J YfhfUi Ybg']b '? fmdhc

⇒ 'Ť\ f'&\$&'Yf'YVhY'X]Y'? fmdhc]bXi ghf]Y'a Y\ fYfY
gW ĀX`]WY'9fY][b]ggYž'X]Y'XUg'J YfhfUi Yb']b'XUg'^2 _cgmghYa
XYf'X][]hU`Yb'5ggYhg'Yf\YV`]W'gWk ĀW hYb"' ðj YghcfYb'i bX
ðhYfYggYb[fi ddYb'k i fXYb'j cb'XYb': c`[Ybž'X]Y'j cb
nYbhfU`]g]YfhYb'6ŦfgYbUi gZĀ`Yb'V]g`]b'ni `VY\ŦfX`]WYb
FUnn]Yb'fY]W hYbž']bg'K Ub_Yb'[YVfUW h"⇒ 'Ni [Y'X]YgYf
<YfUi gZcfXYfi b[Yb'_Āa dZYb'j]Y'Y'6fUbWYbZŦ\ fYf'XUa]hž
XUg'J YfhfUi Yb']b'? fmdhc'k]YXYf'Ui Zni VUi Yb"'9]b
I bhYfbY\ a Ybž'XUg'a i h][Y'GW f]hhY']b'F]W hi b['X]YgYg'N]Y`g
i bhYfb]a a hž']gh'X]Y'ZŦ\ fYbXY'? fmdhc!6ŦfgY'6]bUbW"
6]bUbW`]gh'XYf'5bg]W hž'XUgg'X]Y'J YfVYggYfi b['XYg
J YfhfUi Ybg'i bX'XYf'G]W Yf\Y]h'j cb'? fmdhc!5ggYhg
YbhgWY]XYbX`]ghž'i a 'X]Y'U`[Ya Y]bY'5_nYdhUbni
VYgW`Yi b][Ybž'Ui ZX]Y'X]Y'6fUbWY'gY]h`Ub[Ya
]bUfVY]hYh"'8]Y'6ŦfgY' / Ua d^Y`]d/



⇒ 'Ť\ f'&\$&'Yf'YVhY'X]Y'? fmdhc]bXi ghf]Y'a Y\ fYfY'gW ĀX`]WY
9fY][b]ggYž'X]Y'XUg'J YfhfUi Yb']b'XUg'^2 _cgmghYa 'XYf'X][]hU`Yb
5ggYhg'Yf\YV`]W'gWk ĀW hYb"' ðj YghcfYb'i bX'ðhYfYggYb[fi ddYb

k i fXYb j cb XYb : c [YbžX]Y j cb nYbhfU g]YfhYb 6ÖfgYbUi gZÄ`Yb V]g` \]b`ni` VY\ÖfX`]WYb`F Unn]Yb`fY]W hYbž]bg`K Ub_Yb`[YVfUW h"

æ`Ni [Y`X]YgYf`<YfUi gZcfXYfi b[Yb`_Äa dZYb`j]Y`Y 6fUbWYbZØ\ fYf`XUa]hž`XUg`J YfhfUi Yb`]b`? fmdhc`k]YXYf Ui Zni VUi Yb`"9]b`i bhYfbY\ a Ybž`XUg`a i h][Y`GW f]hY`]b`F]W hi b[X]YgYg`N]Y`g`i bhYfb]a a hž`]gh`X]Y`ZØ\ fYbXY`? fmdhc!6ÖfgY`6]bUbW`"

6]bUbW`]gh`XYf`5bg]W hž`XUgg`X]Y`J YfVYggYfi b[`XYg`J YfhfUi Ybg i bX`XYf`G]W Yf\Y]h]j cb`? fmdhc!5ggYhg`YbhgWY]XYbX`]ghž`i a`X]Y U`[Ya`Y]bY`5_nYdhUn`ni`VYgW`Yi b][Ybž`Ui Z`X]Y`X]Y`6fUbWY`gY]h`Ub[Ya` \]bUfVY]hYh`"8]Y`6ÖfgY`]gh`VYghfYVhž`]b`X]YgYa`5gdY_h ZØ\ fYbX`ni`gY]b`i bX`Y]b`_UfYg`6Y]gd]Y`ni`gYmYbž`XYa`UbXYfY 79Lg`Zc`[Yb`_ÖbbYb"

5`g`HY]`X]YgYf`HfUbgdUfYbnVYa Ø\i b[Yb`\Uh`6]bUbW`_Øfn`]W`Y]b bYi Yg`GhfUhY []YdUd]Yf`a]h`XYa`H]hY` 6i]`X]b[`Hfi gh]b`h\Y 7fmdhc`9WcgmghYa`j YfÖZZYbh]W h`"8]YgYg`; fi bXgUhdUd]Yf`ghY`h F]W h]b]Yb`j cfž`X]Y`XYhU]`Yfh`VYgW fY]VYbž`k]Y`6fUbWYbU`hYi fY i bX`6Ybi hnYf`ni`gUa`a YbUfVY]hYb`_ÖbbYbž`i a`XUg`J YfhfUi Ybž`X]Y G]W Yf\Y]h`i bX`XYb`GW i hn]a`? fmdhc!F Ui a`ni`j YfVYggYfb"

8 Ug`GhfUhY []YdUd]Yf`k]fX`Ui W`j cb`Y]bYf`gdYn]Y`Yb`GY]hY`ni`a 5i ZVUi`j cb`J YfhfUi Yb`VY[`Y]hYhž`Ui ZXYf`YXYf`gY\Yb`_Ubbž`k]Y 6]bUbW`X]Y`bYi Yb`A U» bU\ a Yb`i a gYhnh`"8 Ug`l bhYfbY\ a Yb`\Uh X]YgY`GY]hY`U`Ya` [Yk]Xa`Yhž`k Ug`a]h`J YfhfUi Yb`i bX`HfUbgdUfYbn ni`hi b`\Uh`"æ` : c [YbXYb`g]bX`Y]b][Y`GW f]hY`Ui Z[YZØ\ fhž`X]Y 6]bUbW`i bhYfbca`a Yb`\Uhž`i a`J YfhfUi Yb`i bX`HfUbgdUfYbn`ni ZÖfXYfb"

HfUbgdUfYbn`XYf` : cbXg

8 Ug`YfghY`[fc» Y`9`Ya Ybh`XYg`; fi bXgUhdUd]Yfg`]gh`XYf`g]W YfY l a [Ub[`a]h`?i bXYb[Y`XYfb`"6]bUbW`]gh`XYf`5bg]W hž`XUgg nYbhfU`g]YfhY`6ÖfgYb`Y]bYb`bYi Yb`5bgUhn`ZØf`X]Y`HfUbgdUfYbn j cb`6Ybi hnYf[Y`XYfb`j YfZc`[Yb`a ØggYbž`i a`XUg`J YfhfUi Yb`XYf

6Ybi hnYf'k jYXYf\Yfni ghY`Yb"

6]bUbW` \Uh'j YfgW]YXYbY`DfccZ'cZ'F YgYfj Yg'fDcF !GmghYa Y
Y]b[YZØ\fhž'X]Y`nk Y]`XYf'g]W]YfghYb`i bX`hfUbgdUfYbHghYb
fmdhc[fUZ]gW]Yb`Hcc`g'j Yfk YbXYbž'A Yf`Y`HfYY`i bX`NYfc!
?bck`YX[Y`Gi W]bWh`Bcb! hYfUWh]j Y`5f[i a Ybh'cZ?bck`YX[Y`fh_!
GB5F?gŁ`8]YgYg`DcF!GmghYa`Yfa Ò[`]W]h'Yg'6]bUbW!6Ybi hnYfbž
]\fY`F YgYfj Yb`ni`ØVYfdFØZYbž'k Å\fybX`gYbg]V`Y
6Ybi hnYf]bZcfa Uh]cbYb`df]j Uh`V`Y]VYb"

6]bUbW`[Y\h'bcW`Y]bYb`GW]f]h'h'k Y]hYfž`]bXYa`Yg'gY]bY`K U`YH!
5XfYggYb`a`]h`YXYa`DcF!GbUdg\ch'cZZYb`Y[h`8]Yg`Yf\Ø\h'XUg
J YfhfUi Yb`XYf'6Ybi hnYfž'XU`g]Y`X]Y`F YgYfj Yb`Ui Z'XYf'6`cW`W]U]b
Y]bgY\Yb`_ØbbYb" `I a`X]Y`9]bZØ\fi b[`X]YgYg`DcF!GmghYa`g`ni
ZØfXYfbž`\Uh'6]bUbW`XYb`ni [fi bXY`]Y[YbXYb`7cXY`U`g`CdYb
Gci fW`j YfØZZYbh`]W]hž'XUa`]h`UbXYfY`6ØfgYb`]\b`j Yfk YbXYb`i bX
]\fY`HfUbgdUfYbn`j YfVYggYfb`_ØbbYb"

G]W]Yf\Y]h

6]bUbW`df]cf]g]Yfh'X]Y`G]W]Yf\Y]h`XYf`J Yfa Ò[Yb'gk YfhY`XYf
6Ybi hnYf`i bX`UbXYfYf'gYbg]V`Yf'6Ybi hnYf]bZcfa Uh]cbYbž'X]Y
k Å\fybX`XYg`?bck`Mci f`7i ghca`Yf'f?M7!DfcnYggYg`Yf\U`hYb
k YfXYb`8U\Yf`j Yfk YbXYh'X]Y`6ØfgY`Y]b][Y`XYf`fcVi ghYghYb
J YfgW`ØggY`i b[ga`Yh`cXYbž'i a`X]YgY`g]W]Yf`ni` \U`hYb"

6]bUbW`gdY]W]Yfh'XYb`; fc»hY]`XYf'6Ybi hnYf[Y`XYf`]b
?Ø\`Ài`gYfb" `9g`j Yfk YbXYh'Ui W]`Zc'fhgW]f]h'h]W]Y
G]W]Yf\Y]hga U»bU\`a`Ybž'Y]bgW]`]Y»`]W]`A`i`h]!G][bUhi`f!`i bX
GW]k Y`Ybg][bUhi`fgW]Ya UhU`fHGGŁž'i a`X]Y`G]W]Yf\Y]h`XYf`; Y`XYf
XYf'6Ybi hnYf`ni`[Yk Å\f`Y]ghYb"

8]Y`6ØfgY`[`Ui Vh'Ui W]ž'XUgg`gY`Vgh'X]Y`g]W]YfghYb`GmghYa Y
Ui`gZU`Yb`_ØbbYb" `5`g`gc`W]Yg`\Uh'Yg`Y]bYb
BchZU`j Yfg]W]Yfi b[gZcbXg`[YgW]UZZYbž'XYf'gY]bY`6Ybi hnYf`]a
: U`Y`Y]bYf`G]W]Yf\Y]hgj Yf`Yhni b[`gW]Øhnh" `8Yf`GYW`fY`5ggYh`i bX
Zcf`I`gYfg`fG5: I Ł`\Uh'XYfnY]h'Y]b`; i h\UVYb`j cb`%A`]UfXY`I`G!
8c`Uf"

HfUbgdUfYbn'i bX`C ZZYb`Y[i b[

5b[Ya YggYbY`HfUbgdUfYbn'i bX`C ZZYb`Y[i b[`g]bX`YbhgWXY]XYbX
Z0f`X]Y : 0fXYfi b[`XYg`J YfhfUi Ybg`]b`X]Y ? fmdhc]bXi ghf]Y"
< UbXY`gd`UhhZcfa Yb`a 0ggYb`Yg`XYb`6Ybi hnYfb`Yfa 0[`]WXYbžni
0VYfdf0ZYbžcV`] \fY`J Yfa 0[Ybgk YfhY`g]WXYf`Ui ZVYk U`fh`k YfXYb"
6]bUbW`gW`A[h`X]Y`J Yfk YbXi b[`j cb`DfccZcZFYgYfj Yg
fDcF 4!C ZZYb`Y[i b[Yb`j cfž`X]Y`a `h`]bbcj Uh]j Yb
HfUbgdUfYbn`0gi b[Yb`k]Y`n_!GB5F?g`i bX`A Yf`Y`HfYY`YfghY`h
k i fXYb` `Y]bY`HYW`bc`c[]Yž`X]Y`X]Y`9Z]n]Ybn'i bX`G]WXYf`Y]h`XYf
6`cW`W U]b`Yf`0\hž`]bXYa `8 UhYb`ni f`Y]bZUWYb` , VYfdf0Z] b[`]b
Y]bYf`gmghYa Uh]gWYb`FY] \YbZc`[Y`_cX]Yfh`k YfXYb"
NYfc! ? bck `YX[Y`Gi W]bW`Bcb! 4hYfUWh]j Y`5f[i a Ybh`cZ
? bck `YX[Y`fh_!GB5F?g`k`]gh`Y]b`_fmdhc[fUZ]gWXYf`6Yk Y]gž`a `]h`XYa
a Ub`bUW`k Y]gYb`_Ubbž`XUgg`a Ub`VYgh]a a hY`4Zcfa Uh]cbYb
VYg]hnhž`c`bY`X]Y` 4Zcfa Uh]cbYb`dfY]gni [YVYb``8U`n_!GB5F?g
b]W`h`ZUVf]n]Yfh`cXYf`a Ub]di `]Yfh`k YfXYb`_0bbYbž`_0bbYb
6Ybi hnYf`YXYfnY]h`X]Y`G]WXYf`Y]h`] \fYf`J Yfa 0[Ybgk YfhY`Ub`Y]bYf
60fgY`0VYfdf0ZYb"

F]g]_ca UbU[Ya Ybh

9]b`YZZ`_hj Yg`F]g]_ca UbU[Ya Ybh`]gh`YbhgWXY]XYbXž`i a `XUg
J YfhfUi Yb`]b`Y]bY`gc`j c`Uh]Y`6fUbWXY`k]Y`? fmdhc`ni `VYk U`fYb"
J]Y`Y`I bhYfb`Y`a Yb`g]bX`]a `j Yf[Ub[YbYb`4\`f`Ui Z[fi bX
i b[Ydf0Z]Yf` : fYa X`Ud]hU`dcg]h]cbYbž`0VYfVYg]WXYfhYf`? fYX]hY
i bX`i bni fY]WXYbXYf`G]WXYfi b[gZcbXg`ni gUa a Yb[YVfcWXYb"

6]bUbW`]gh`XYf`5bg]W`hž`XUgg`60fgYb`g]WXYfghY`Yb`a 0ggYbž`XUgg
? fYX]hY`Ub[Ya YggYb`VYg]WXYfh`g]bXž`i bX`j Yfa Y]XYb`a 0ggYbž
GW`i`XYb`Ui Zni bY`a Ybž`i a `9! dUbg]cbgd`AbY`ni `Z]bUbn]YfYbž`i a
gc`WXY`J cfZ`Y`]b`Ni `i bZ`ni `j Yf`]bXYfb``G]Y`a 0ggYb`Ui W
g]WXYfghY`Ybž`XUgg`Hc`_Yb`ghfYb[Y` , VYfdf0Z] b[gj YfZU`fYb
Xi fW`Ui ZYbž`VYj cf`g]Y`[Y`]ghYh`k YfXYbž`i a `X]Y`6Ybi hnYf`j cf
4j Ygh]h]cbYb`]b`Dfc`Y`hY`a `]h[Yf]b[Yf` ; `Ui Vk 0fX][`Y]h`i bX
`c`Y`a `F]g]_c`ni `gW`0hnYb`i bX`[`Y]W`nY]h][`X]Y`6Ybi hnYf`XUf0VYf
Ui Zni `A`fYbž`k]Y`XYf`? fmdhca Uf`h`Z] b`_h]cb]Yfh`BcW`k]W`h][Yf
]ghž`XUgg`60fgYb`0VYf`6Ybi hnYfgW`i hna `]hY`U`g`G]WXYf`Y]hgbYhn

j YfZØ[Yb'a ØggYbž'i a '6Ybi hnYf']b : Ä`Yb'j cb'G]WXYf\Y]hg`ØW_Yb
i bX`Yi hfYa Yb'6ÄfYba Äf_hYb'ni 'gWØhnYb"

G]WXYf\Y]h'XYf'; Y`XYf'XYf'6Ybi hnYf

6]bUbW`ghY`h'g]WXYfž'XUgg'U`Y'6Ybi hnYfj Yfa Ø[Ybgk YfhY`%.%
[Yg]WXYfh'i bX`Xi fW`X]Y` \ØW ghYb'G]WXYf\Y]hgghUbXUfXg`ZØf
6f]YZhUgWXYb [YgWØhnh'g]bX"8]Y`D`UhhZcfa ` \Uh`_Øfn`]W`]\fY
GY`Vghj Yfk U\fi b[g`Øgi b[`Y]bYg'8f]hhUbV]YhYfgž`Hfi gh`K U`Yhž
U_hi U`]g]Yfhž'i a `ni gÄhn`]WXY`G]WXYf\Y]hgZi b_h]cbYb'ni `]bhY[f]YfYbž
X]Y`X]Y`g]WXYfY`5i ZVYk U\fi b[`XYf`J Yfa Ø[Ybgk YfhY`XYf'6Ybi hnYf
[Yk Ä`f`Y]ghYb"

8]Y'6ØfgY`j Yfn]WXYh'Ui W`XUfUi Zž?i bXYb[Y`XYf`c`bY
Ni gh]a a i b[`XYf'6Ybi hnYf`ZØf`UbXYfY`Nk YW_Y`ni `j Yfk YbXYb"

B UWk Y]g`XYf`F YgYfj Yb

B UW`XYa `Ni gUa a YbVfi W`j cb` : HLž'XYf`XUa U`g`Xf]hh[fØ» hYb
79L`Ui ZXYa `A Uf_hž'a UW hYb`X]Y`6Ya Ø\i b[Yb'j cb'6]bUbWž'XUg
J YfhfUi Yb`i bX`X]Y`HfUbgdUfYbn`]b`XYf`? fmdhc]bXi ghf]Y`ni
ghÄf`Ybž`Y]bYb [fc» Yb`GW`f]hh`bUW`j`cfb"8]Y'6ØfgY
j YfØZYbh`]WXY`ja `Bcj Ya VYf`&\$&&`\fY`YfghY`DcF!C ZYb`Y[i b[ž
X]Y`Ui ZA Yf`_Y`HfYY`VUg]Yfh"

æa ` : YVfi Uf`&\$&' `U_hi U`]g]YfhY`6]bUbW`gY]bY`DcF!C ZYb`Y[i b[
a]h'n`!GB5F?gžk Ug`Y]bY`XYi h]WXY`J YfVYggYfi b[`[Y[YbØVYf
XYa `j`cf`Yf][Yb`GmghYa `XUfghY`h"8i fW`X]Y`C ZYb`Y[i b[`gY]bYf
F YgYfj Yb`Yfa Ø[`]W`h'6]bUbW`gY]bYb`Bi hnYfbž`X]Y`G]WXYf\Y]h
]\fYf`J Yfa Ø[Ybgk YfhY`YXYfnY]h`ni `ØVYfdfØZb"9]b`k Y]hYfYg
l dXUhY`ja `A Äfn`&\$&' `nY][hž'XUgg`X]Y`DcF!C ZYb`Y[i b[`j`cb
6]bUbW`U_hi U`]g]Yfh`k i fXYž'i a `X]Y`J Yf]Z]n]Yfi b[`j`cb
6Ybi hnYfj Yfa Ø[Yb`ZØf`]bg[YgUa h`(& `Hc_Yb'ni `Yfa Ø[`]WXYb"

GhfYb[Y`Hc_Yb!5i Z`]ghi b[gUbZcfXYfi b[Yb

6Yj`cf`Y]b`Hc_Yb`Ui Z'XYf'6]bUbW`!D`UhhZcfa `[Y`]ghYh`k]fXž'a ØggYb

X]Y`Dfc`Y_hY`ghfYb[Y`5bZcfXYfi b[Yb`YfZØ`Ybž`i a `]\fY`9][bi b[`ni
VYgh]a a Yb``8UXi fW`_ØbbYb`6Ybi hnYf`bi f`]b`[fØbX`]W`[YdfØZhY
Dfc`Y_hY`]bj Ygh]YfYb"

6]bUbW`G5: I

6]bUbW`df]cf]g]Yfh`XYb`GW`i hn`XYf`J Yfa Ø[Yb`gk YfhY`XYf
6Ybi hnYf``8U\Yf`j YfZØ[h`Yg`ØVYf`Y]bYb`G5: I !: cbXg`fGYW`fY
5ggYh: i bX`Zcf`l`gYfgł`XYf`6Ybi hnYf`]b`gW`k YfYb`: Å`Yb`gW`Øhnh"
6]bUbW`\Uh`XYfnY]h`Yhk U`%A]``UfXY`8c`Uf`]b`gY]bYa`G5: I "

8YhU]`g

6Ygi W`Yb`G]Y`i bg`Ui Z.`_fmdhc!bYk`g"Uh